

School of Nursing Preliminary Examination & Dissertation Evaluation Form

Student Name: _____

Date of Exam/Dissertation: _____

Dissertation Committee Chair: _____

Other Dissertation Committee Members: _____

This form is to be completed by the Chair with input from the committee. The evaluation should be based on both the written proposal and the oral defense. Students must receive an average score >3 to receive a “Satisfactory” grade. Please return the completed form to the PhD Program Director, 4320 400NIB, and OSAMS, 1160 400NIB or UMSN-advisors@med.umich.edu.

	Poor (1)	Developing (2)	Good (3)	Outstanding (4)	Overall Score
Knowledge	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor breadth and depth of understanding of the area of study; <input type="checkbox"/> Difficulty evaluating background literature; <input type="checkbox"/> Difficulty understanding implications of existing research.	<input type="checkbox"/> Limited breadth or depth (but not both) of the subject; <input type="checkbox"/> With some help, could synthesize and evaluate background literature; <input type="checkbox"/> Limited understanding of implications of existing research.	<input type="checkbox"/> Sufficient breadth and depth of understanding; <input type="checkbox"/> Could identify and discuss key background for the study; <input type="checkbox"/> Some attempts at discussing implications of most important research findings.	<input type="checkbox"/> Solid breadth and depth of knowledge; <input type="checkbox"/> Able to integrate information from multiple sources. <input type="checkbox"/> Able to describe, discuss, critically evaluate relevant background information; <input type="checkbox"/> Could draw clear conclusions from and discuss implications of most important research findings.	1 2 3 4
Hypotheses and/or Research Questions	<input type="checkbox"/> Unfocused; <input type="checkbox"/> None provided; <input type="checkbox"/> No rationale is provided.	<input type="checkbox"/> Able to formulate purposeful research questions, but has difficulty explaining rationale; <input type="checkbox"/> Imprecise/poorly stated; <input type="checkbox"/> Significance is unclear.	<input type="checkbox"/> Hypotheses and research questions are well-stated with adequate rationale; <input type="checkbox"/> Significance of hypotheses and research questions is clear and well stated.	<input type="checkbox"/> Very significant and novel hypotheses/research questions; <input type="checkbox"/> Strong, clear rationale for hypotheses/research questions;	1 2 3 4

Research and Design Methods (Technical Skills, if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/> Study design not clear; No research method is specified; <input type="checkbox"/> Limitations of methods not understood or discussed; <input type="checkbox"/> Have no technical skills to carry out the research.	<input type="checkbox"/> Study design is explained, but lacks theoretical support; <input type="checkbox"/> Rationale for selected research methods is not well established; <input type="checkbox"/> Awareness of some weaknesses in research design; <input type="checkbox"/> Some awareness of alternative approaches; <input type="checkbox"/> Have limited technical skills to carry out the research project.	<input type="checkbox"/> Study design and selected methods are generally sufficient to address the hypotheses but need some modification; <input type="checkbox"/> Could identify strengths and weaknesses of research design and methods; <input type="checkbox"/> Demonstrates understanding of alternative approaches; <input type="checkbox"/> Have sufficient technical skills to carry out the research project.	<input type="checkbox"/> Able to identify and logically discuss strengths and weaknesses of research design and methods; <input type="checkbox"/> Understands the theory <input type="checkbox"/> Appropriately compared and discussed alternative research approaches; <input type="checkbox"/> Have advanced technical skills to conduct the study.	1 2 3 4
Data Analysis and Discussion of Results (Dissertation Defense only)	<input type="checkbox"/> Data not analyzed or not presented in a coherent fashion, no insight in analyzing data at deeper level shown; <input type="checkbox"/> Results not interpreted or not interpretable.	<input type="checkbox"/> Data presentation is unclear and incoherent in some cases, little insight into meaning of data; <input type="checkbox"/> Results interpreted, but serious flaws in analysis approach.	<input type="checkbox"/> Data analysis and presentation clear and understandable, some evidence of deeper interpretation and analysis of data; <input type="checkbox"/> Interpretation consistent with data.	<input type="checkbox"/> Data presentation is highly organized and clear, deep analysis and understanding of all the data and their implications; <input type="checkbox"/> Results clear and very well explained.	1 2 3 4
Communication	<input type="checkbox"/> Disorganized slides and/or write-up with grammatical errors; <input type="checkbox"/> Arguments are incomplete or poorly organized; <input type="checkbox"/> Did not understand/address the questions asked; <input type="checkbox"/> Poor English language skills.	<input type="checkbox"/> Slides or write-up not very clear; <input type="checkbox"/> Oral presentation was clear, but student had to read the slides most of the time; <input type="checkbox"/> Arguments are logical and organized; <input type="checkbox"/> Understood most of the questions but provided only partial answers; <input type="checkbox"/> Spoken English was, for the most part, understandable.	<input type="checkbox"/> Write-up and slides largely well written; <input type="checkbox"/> Some discontinuities during the oral presentation; <input type="checkbox"/> Arguments are articulated and well organized; <input type="checkbox"/> Understood questions and provided adequate answers; <input type="checkbox"/> Could be readily understood.	<input type="checkbox"/> Slides and write-up clearly written in the appropriate format; <input type="checkbox"/> Poised and polished in the oral presentation; <input type="checkbox"/> Understood the questions and provided clear, thorough answers; <input type="checkbox"/> Took the discussion to a higher level.	1 2 3 4

Additional Comments: _____
